P/18/031 Tregarthen's Hotel, Garrison Hill, St Mary's

Thank you for consulting us on this application. We have consulted the submitted heritage documents and concur with the conclusions of the archaeological desk-based assessment that there is a high potential for buried post-medieval archaeology and a moderate potential for buried archaeology of earlier periods. Potential remains may be of national significance in the northwestern part of the site, and of local significance elsewhere.

The northwestern part of the site has been found to contain a great depth of topsoil, up to 2.5m deep, and this has been used to as evidence to suggest that this is the result of the importation of topsoil to level part of the garden area behind a retaining wall. Whilst this may be the case the possibility that the wide disparity in recorded depths of this material across this part of the site may be the result of backfilling an earlier fortification ditch does not seem to have been considered. As the report states, any such remains would be of national significance.

We therefore consider that further evaluation of the site and its historic resource is necessary. Evaluation trenching over the northwestern part of the site in the garden area should be undertaken in accordance with a trench layout plan submitted to, and approved by, the Local Planning Authority. We cannot advise further until the appropriate evaluation report has been provided. This application should not be determined before this evaluation report is received and we have had an opportunity to comment further. This evaluation should be carried out by a suitably qualified organisation or individual in accordance with accepted national guidelines. This is in accordance with the provisions of NPPF Section 12, paragraph 128 and Isles of Scilly Local Plan policy 1(B). Should an adequate report not be forthcoming, then further consultation with us is advised before determination.

We also note that no updated heritage statement, to assess the impacts of the revised scheme on the built heritage and designated sites, appears to have been submitted. We note the objections of Historic England to the pitched roof of the previous application. It is unclear as to whether this objection has been considered and taken into account with this revised application. Please submit a revised heritage statement and re-consult us.