

**AONB Planning Consultative Panel
Report to Chief Planning Officer
September 7th 2012**

**Commentary on Planning Applications for Determination
by Planning and Development Committee on September 18th 2012**

P/12/087 (Change of Use) and P/12/088 (Listed Building Consent) The Harbourside Hotel, The Quay, Hugh Town, St Mary's. External and internal alterations and change of use to Harbourside Hotel which is part of the listed pier at St Mary's.

PCP notes that the ground floor Waiting Room is the same size and general configuration as the existing facility. Therefore, PCP believes that an opportunity may have been missed to enhance the Waiting Room, as well as the luggage/small freight handling with which it is associated. Visitors, residents and off-Island businesses rely on this space for the storage and redistribution of luggage and small freight. The proposed plans would do no more than retain the *status quo*, thereby failing to enhance residents' and visitors' experience of the quay.

PCP also understands that Visitor Welcoming/Interpretation facilities would also be incorporated into the Waiting Room (in the section currently operating as the Isles of Scilly Wildlife Trust Visitor Centre). Therefore, PCP concludes that two important functions of the harbour-side building: visitor welcoming/orientation and the management of luggage/small freight (especially to and from the off-Islands) have been compressed into such a small space that neither function is likely to operate effectively.

PCP takes the view that the proposed fenestration would enhance the quality of the Listed Building and, by extension, part of the AONB and Conservation Area that is frequently accessed by residents and visitors.

PCP also believes that the proposed balcony would enhance visitor experience by providing an outdoor dining experience (above) and shelter (below). However, PCP is not persuaded that a Victorian-style balcony would be appropriate on a building that has no discernible Victorian character. PCP accepts that the Victorian-style balcony seeks to reference the development of St Mary's Quay during the nineteenth century. However, appending a Victorian-style balcony to a utilitarian twentieth century façade would be potentially jarring (notwithstanding the fact that nineteenth century features lay hidden beneath the twentieth century façade)