



COUNCIL OF THE ISLES OF SCILLY

Planning & Development Department

Town Hall, The Parade, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly, TR21 0LW

01720 424350

planning@scilly.gov.uk

Delegated Report

Application Number: P/14/058/FUL

Recommendation/Level: PER/DEL

Date: 18th December 2014

Target Date: 31/12/2014

Neighbours Notified on: 21/11/2014 **Expiry Date:** 12/12/2014

Site Address: 3 Porthcressa Terrace, Hugh Town,

Island: STMARYs

Development Proposed: Replace all existing roof slates to the main elevation of the rear of the property using diminishing Spanish slates. (Conservation Area)

No of Representations: None

Chair and Vice Chair: Case officer discussed with the Chair of Planning Committee on 11/12/14 and the Vice-Chair on 12/12/14. Both happy with a Delegated Decision

Development Plan Policies:

2005 Local Plan

Policy 1 Environmental Protection

2012 NPPF

Paragraphs 132, 133 and 134 in particular

Planning Assessment

The Site

No 3 Porthcressa Terrace is a mid-terraced property in a row of 4. The properties are of a traditional appearance, constructed in granite with a natural wet-lay 'scantle' roof. The front facing roof sloped has previously been replaced with a dry-lay natural slate on all 4 dwellings in this terrace. This is a distinctive row of properties, however, and is mentioned in "The Buildings of Scilly" by Laws, P (1990) where it is stated that the architect "*had a feeling for the character of Hugh Town when he compiled his design*". The pitch of the roof is steep at around 45° (approximate angle) and the ground level of the terrace is raised several feet above the level of the garden. The dwellings are a storey and a half with rooms in the roof spaces. No 3 has a large dormer extension to the rear.

Development Proposed

The roofs of all properties along Porthcressa Terrace were originally covered, front and rear, with a wet-laid delabole scantle slate. The rear roof slope retains the scantle on all 4 properties and has had various patch repair jobs in recent years. The applicant has expressed concern that in severe weather there is a chance that even if a small part of the roof is loose it could cause large areas of the slate to become detached due to the nature of the construction of a scantle slate roof. The applicant wishes to replace the rear roof slope, which is a patched up original scantle roof, with a dry-lay natural slate roof secured with metal pegs. This is a common modern method for replacing deteriorated scantle roofs locally.

Assessment

The principal consideration for this application is whether it preserves or enhances the character of the conservation area. The buildings are not listed but are important in that they form part of the traditional built environment of Hugh Town. The traditional scantle roofing material is an important part of the character of older properties. The article 4 direction that covers the entire Isles of Scilly removed the permitted development right to make alterations to the roof of a residential property. It is on this basis alone that planning permission is required for the work.

Impact upon the Character of the Conservation Area

I consider that all 4 properties that make up Porthcressa Terrace have lost scantle on the front facing roof slope and as such it is difficult to conclude that loosing the scantle from the rear roof slope would be harmful to the wider character of the conservation area. The rear is in a deteriorated state and likely to have reached the end of its useful life. Whilst it is a characteristic and traditional means of covering a roof it is not a practical method since the use of waterproof membranes during the later part of the 20th century. Older wet-lay roofs usually fail due to the laths that the slates are hung on deteriorate and rot away which causes sections of slate to slip away, known as 'riffle'. Where iron nails, as opposed to oak pegs, have been used these can corrode 'nail fatigue' also causing slate to slip. It may be, however, that in this case the repaired sections have been undertaken with the incorrect mortar. If a true lime has not been used and cement is used to speed up the 'set' then this is too hard causing cracks and again causing slate to slip away and be prone to weathering. It did seem that cement had been used previously to repair the roof due to the stark contrast of the repaired areas.

The use of natural slate is considered an appropriate material in this highly dense area of Hugh Town where there is a distinct mixture of roofing styles and materials. I do not consider it will give rise to significant harm to the overall character of the area and whilst it would not 'enhance' the use of natural slate would at the very least 'preserve' the character of the conservation area.

Impact upon Residential Amenity

The replacement of the roofing material would have no long-term detrimental impact upon the amenity of neighbouring properties. It would be important to condition the working hours of the construction phase of the proposal to ensure this does not cause noise or other disturbances to adjoining properties. Overall however I do not consider there will be any other harm as a result of this proposal.

Other considerations

The ministerial Statement 'Planning for Growth' and the National Planning Policy Framework have been taken into account in assessing this scheme.

The proposal will not have any detrimental impacts upon the wider landscape or Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty.

Conclusion

In view of the above assessment I consider that the proposals are acceptable and recommend that planning permission and listed building consent be granted.

Signed: L WALTON

Date: 18/12/2014

Lisa Walton

Senior Officer: Planning & Development Management