

## King, Andrew

---

**From:** Ratcliffe Daniel <dratcliffe@cornwall.gov.uk>  
**Sent:** 17 August 2015 17:09  
**To:** King, Andrew  
**Cc:** Hickman, Simon (Simon.Hickman@english-heritage.org.uk)  
**Subject:** RE: P/15/060/FUL: Tregarthen's Hotel, Garrison Hill, St Mary's

Dear Andrew,

Many thanks for the consultation on this application.

Tregarthens Hotel, which developed from pre-existing cottages to which new buildings and hotel accommodation have been added from the 19<sup>th</sup> century to the present day, lies immediately to the east of Scheduled Monument 1018370 "Post-medieval breastwork, curtain wall and associated defensive structures on the periphery of The Garrison, St Mary's." This section is also a GI Listed Building.

Fortification of 'The Hugh' (the promontory to the immediate west of Hugh town), began in 1593-4 with the building of 'Star Castle' as an artillery position. This was enhanced in around 1601 with the construction of a curtain wall coast to coast along the east of The Hugh from Gunners Well Battery in the north to Lower Benham Battery in the south. This is the oldest section of the Garrison Walls. The Scheduling description notes that early plans show the wall flanked along its entire length by an outer ditch, now largely infilled..." Where this survives elsewhere the ditch remains up to 4m wide and 0.5m deep, but this is in itself likely to be the result of steady backfilling and silting and the original ditch can probably safely be assumed to have been of greater dimensions.

Early records indicate that the defensive line also included a glacis (artificial slope intended to give added protection to the walls and assure a clear line of fire for those defending them) extending up to 15m from the outer face of the wall.

Heritage asset issues requiring consideration in the determination of this application include:

- The significance of the area designated as a Scheduled Monument (which overlaps the current building line closest to the walls) and the ground beneath. Works within the red line of the Scheduled Monument would require Scheduled Monument Consent from Historic England.
- The setting of the walls, which in addition to being Scheduled are jointly designated as a Grade I Listed Building. The setting of Grade I and Scheduled Assets carries 'great weight' under the National Planning Policy Framework. Substantial harm, including harm through harm to setting, should be 'wholly exceptional'.
- The archaeological potential of ground likely to be disturbed in the course of the redevelopment of the site. This potential is evidently high where remains of the original curtain wall ditch and glacis may have survived despite later development impacts. Undesignated archaeological assets may be of local to national importance, the NPPF indicating that the conservation of the latter category should attract the same planning weight as nationally important designated assets.

Paragraph 128 of the National Planning Policy Framework states

"In determining applications, local planning authorities should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. The level of detail should be proportionate to the assets' importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposal on their significance. As a minimum the relevant historic environment record should have been

consulted and the heritage assets assessed using appropriate expertise where necessary. Where a site on which development is proposed includes or has the potential to include heritage assets with archaeological interest, local planning authorities should require developers to submit an appropriate desk-based assessment and, where necessary, a field evaluation.”

Currently no detailed analysis of the significance of the heritage assets affected by these proposals is included within the submitted documents and as such it is not possible to give informed advice as to the degree of impact to designated and undesignated assets, or indeed to form a view as to whether the impact to buried remains may be reasonably mitigated by archaeological recording.

We would recommend an archaeological desk based assessment of the scheme is sought from the applicants, making use of appropriately qualified expertise. This assessment should draw upon the considerable historic records of the fortifications; consider the requirement for field evaluation of below ground potential prior to detailed decision making; and consider the impacts of the scheme on the setting of the designated assets. The effect of the design treatment of the two cottages proposed at the Garrison Hill entrance on the overall setting of the fortifications should be included within this assessment. These appear to introduce elements of form (pyramidal roofs with ball finials) and slit embrasure style windows – an introduction of faux historic form which may have a damaging effect on the archaeological interpretation of the site as a whole by non experts.

I would be happy to discuss the detail of further assessment with the applicants if required.

I note Historic England SW office among the consultees and so have copied their principal inspector into this response, no doubt your conservation officer and their Inspectors will have their own comments to make.

**Daniel Ratcliffe MA MCIfA**

Historic Environment Strategy Lead

Cornwall Council

External tel: 01726 223463 (internal x423463)

Mobile: 07876 266 043

[dratcliffe@cornwall.gov.uk](mailto:dratcliffe@cornwall.gov.uk)

---

**From:** King, Andrew [mailto:AKing@scilly.gov.uk]

**Sent:** 11 August 2015 11:23

**To:** Ratcliffe Daniel; 'e-swest@historicengland.org.uk'; 'davidjackson@islandspartnership.co.uk'; Williams,Eddie; Pearce,Helen; Williams,Rebecca; Thompson,Matthew

**Subject:** RE: P/15/060/FUL: Tregarthen's Hotel, Garrison Hill, St Mary's

Good Morning,

Further to the consultation request sent yesterday below, the subject line contained the incorrect application reference however the content of the email was for the correct application. Correct subject line is now included above. Apologies for any confusion this may have caused.

Regards,

**Andrew King**

Officer: Planning & Development Management

Council of the Isles of Scilly, Town Hall, The Parade, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly, TR21 0LW

Direct Line: 01720 424313 | Planning: 01720 424350 | Reception: 01720 424000 | [aking@scilly.gov.uk](mailto:aking@scilly.gov.uk) | [planning@scilly.gov.uk](mailto:planning@scilly.gov.uk) |

[www.scilly.gov.uk](http://www.scilly.gov.uk)

---

**From:** King, Andrew

**Sent:** 10 August 2015 16:57

**To:** 'Ratcliffe Daniel'; 'e-swest@historicengland.org.uk'; 'office@ancientmonumentsociety.org.uk'; 'davidjackson@islandpartnership.co.uk'; Williams,Eddie; Pearce,Helen; Williams,Rebecca; Thompson,Matthew

**Subject:** P/15/063/FUL: Scillonia Building Supplies, 21 Porthmellon Industrial Estate, St Mary's

Dear Consultee,

## CONSULTATION ON PLANNING APPLICATION

**PLANNING REFERENCE**

P/15/060/FUL

**DEVELOPMENT PROPOSED:**

Refurbishment and modification of the hotel including demolition of dilapidated and unsightly components to the northwest side of the hotel site and those abutting the wall. Formation of improved entrance enhancement of elevation appearance. Formation of 10 no. units of C3 holiday cottages within three blocks within the grounds to the northwest of the hotel and southeast of the hotel (Major Development) (Affecting the Setting of a Listed Building/Scheduled Monument).

**LOCATION:**

Tregarthen's Hotel, Garrison Hill, Hugh Town, St Mary's, Isles Of Scilly, TR21 OPP

The Local Planning Authority would like to consult with you on the above application. Should you wish to make any comments on this application, please make them in writing by **1<sup>st</sup> September 2015** to the Planning Department, the Town Hall, The Parade, Hugh Town, St Marys, Isles of Scilly TR21 0LW or by email to [planning@scilly.gov.uk](mailto:planning@scilly.gov.uk). All forms, details and plans submitted with the application are available online here: <http://www.scilly.gov.uk/planning-application/planning-application-p15060>

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course. If I have not heard from you by the **1<sup>st</sup> September** I will assume you have no comments to make on this application.

Yours sincerely,

**Andrew King**

Officer: Planning & Development Management

Council of the Isles of Scilly, Town Hall, The Parade, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly, TR21 0LW

Direct Line: 01720 424313 | Planning: 01720 424350 | Reception: 01720 424000 | [aking@scilly.gov.uk](mailto:aking@scilly.gov.uk) | [planning@scilly.gov.uk](mailto:planning@scilly.gov.uk) |

[www.scilly.gov.uk](http://www.scilly.gov.uk)

Please note that the Council may need to disclose this e-mail under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 or the Environmental Information Regulations 2004. The information in this e-mail and any attachments is confidential and may be legally privileged. It is intended for the attention and use of the named addressee(s) and must not be disclosed to any other person without our authority.

If you are not the intended recipient, or a person responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient or are aware that this e-mail has been sent to you in error, you are not authorised to and must not disclose, copy, distribute, or retain this message or any part of it. This email is not (nor forms any part of) a legally binding contract. E & OE. If you have received this e-mail in error please inform [postmaster@scilly.gov.uk](mailto:postmaster@scilly.gov.uk)

The statements and opinions expressed in this message are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the organisations within the Council of the Isles of Scilly or any of its Committees.

This e-mail and attachments are intended for above named only and may be confidential. If they have come to you in error you must take no action based on them, nor must you copy or show them to anyone; please e-mail us immediately at [enquiries@cornwall.gov.uk](mailto:enquiries@cornwall.gov.uk).

Please note that this e-mail may be subject to recording and/or monitoring in accordance with the relevant legislation and may need to be disclosed under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 or the Environmental Information Regulations 2004.

Security Warning: It is the responsibility of the recipient to ensure that this e-mail and any attachments are virus free. The Authority will not accept liability for any damage caused by a virus.