



COUNCIL OF THE ISLES OF SCILLY

Planning & Development Department

Town Hall, The Parade, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly, TR21 0LW

01720 424350

planning@scilly.gov.uk

OFFICER REPORT – DELEGATED

Application number: P/16/081/FUL	Expiry date: 5 October 2016
Received on: 10 August 2016	Neighbour expiry date: 31 August 2016
UPRN: 000192000600	Consultation expiry date: 31 August 2016
Legal agreement:	Site notice posted: 10 August 2016
Departure:	Site notice expiry: 31 August 2016
Complies with Development Plan? Y/N If not, ensure you cover in the report how material considerations outweigh the plan?	
Is this decision contrary to local council recommendation?	

Applicant:	Mr Sage
Site Address:	White Horses The Garrison St Mary's Isles Of Scilly TR21 0LS
Proposal:	Demolition of existing white upvc conservatory, remodelling of elevations and external hard landscaping where previously impacted by conservatory and conversion of existing attached garage into new entrance hall. Removal of existing cedar roofing shingles and replacement with new slate roof tiles. Minor alteration to some existing fenestration. Existing and new fenestrations and external vertical timber cladding to be painted dark grey. Excavation of bank garden adjacent to the existing garage to accommodate new air source heat pump and outdoor storage
Application Type:	Planning Permission

Description of site and development:

This is an application to remove an existing white upvc conservatory, internal alterations to convert the existing attached garage into living accommodation, replacement of cedar roofing shingles and replacement with slates, minor alterations to existing windows and repainting existing vertical timber cladding from dark brown to dark grey and excavation of a small section of banked garden to accommodate a new air source heat pump and some small outdoor storage.

White Horses is a 1960 modern detached bungalow located prominently within the garrison walls in an elevated position. It is located within a large domestic curtilage which has an open front garden and a large private rear garden.

Property History

P0301 Erection of a house CA 1961

P4610 Front porch/conservatory and summer house CA 1999

What is unclear from an examination of the plans approved in 1961 is when the house become an 'L' shape footprint as opposed to the rectangular dwelling that was approved under P301 in 1961. Ordnance Survey Plans show that in the 1980s the plan of the property was an 'L' shape. There is no

planning record of either an amended scheme or a later application to extend the dwelling. It is apparent, however that the property as existing, has been in its current form for a period in excess of 30 years.

Public representations:

All neighbouring properties sharing a boundary with the site have been written to directly and a site notice has been placed in a public location within the vicinity of the site for a period of 21 days. A letter of representation has been received from a neighbouring property at Sanderlings, to the south. This letter raises concerns with the position of the Air source heat pumps, which is suggested would be on the boundary with this property. Officers would note that the position of the heat pumps is not on the boundary with Sanderlings, but the position is proposed to be to the rear along the south west side of the dwelling, which is around 10m from the boundary with Sanderlings and will be located within the excavated garden, which will provide a natural screen from both views of and from the noise generated by the equipment.

Consultee representations:

Casework Officer Historic England (1 September 2016): Comments that overall there are no objection to the proposed alterations as it is unlikely to affect the significance of the adjacent or nearby designated heritage assets

Mr Daniel Ratcliffe NONE

Natural Resources and Physical Assets NONE

Natural England (25 August 2016): Comments suggest that in relation to the impact upon 'protected landscapes' NE do not wish to comment. In relation to protected species then NE would refer the LPA to their published standing advice.

Constraints and designations:

Isles of Scilly Conservation Area

AONB

Heritage Coast

Archaeological Constraint Areas Name: The Garrison. Island: St Mary's

HER Findspots Name: STAR CASTLE - Romano British findspot. Period: Romano British

Listed Buildings Lines ID: DCO14277. Grade: I. Name: POWDER MAGAZINE AND BLAST WALLS

Scheduled Monuments DESIGUID: DCO603. NAME: POST-MEDIEVAL BREASTWORK, CURTAIN WALL AND ASSOCIATED DEFENSIVE STRUCTURES ON THE PERIPHERY OF THE GARRISON, ST MARY'S

Scheduled Monuments DESIGUID: DCO604. NAME: THE ROCKET HOUSE 17TH-18TH CENTURY POWDER MAGAZINE AND ADJACENT PRISON ON THE GARRISON, ST MARY'S

Relevant policies, SPGs and Government guidance:

2005 Isles of Scilly Local Plan

Policy 1 Environmental Protection

2007 Isle of Scilly Design Guide

Extensions and alterations In order to conserve the stock of existing buildings on the Isles of Scilly, it may be necessary for them to be adapted for 21st Century uses and requirements. However, in considering how to adapt the building, it is necessary to have regard to maintaining the character of the existing building and its capacity for change. It is also necessary to look at the requirements for extension and alteration; for instance, might the 'need' to have an extra room in a certain location be met instead by considering the reallocation of existing rooms and possibly locating a smaller extension in a different part of the building? In view of the Conservation Area designation covering the islands, the Planning Authority will assess whether a proposal to alter or extend a building will harm its character or

its setting. The Authority will also assess whether the extension or alteration will result in the loss of privacy or daylight in adjacent properties.

Appraisal/key issues and conclusion:

In light of the above mentioned policies and identified designations it is considered that the principal issue for consideration is whether the alterations proposed are in keeping with wider historic character of this area and preserve or enhance the character of the conservation area. Critically the proposal should not result in harm to or loss of significance of designated heritage assets including their setting. It is also a material consideration to assess the impact of any development proposal on the privacy and amenity of existing neighbouring residential properties and land uses.

Impact upon the wider landscape including historic designations and conservation area

As Identified above there are a number of highly designated heritage assets within the immediate vicinity including:

Grade I Listed Building and Scheduled Monument of the Garrison Walls:

Bastion walls and gateway. Wall and bastions across neck of the Hugh begun by Francis Godolphin soon after 1601; batteries and walls encircling peninsula of 1716-46 by Abraham Tovey, Master Gunner. Turf and granite coping to facing walls of dressed granite, the C18 walls being of particularly well-cut granite. Batteries are mostly angular in plan and are located in large bastions found principally at Morning Point, Woolpack Point and south of Steval Point; embrasures to tops of battery walls and gun emplacements formed by large dressed granite slabs. Stone sentry box with segmental-arched doorway and ball finial to pyramidal roof on rampart to east of gateway. Gateway has label mould over moulded arched doorway with sunk spandrels; C18 bellcote above surmounts plaque with date 1742 and GR monogram above plaque with monogram AT. The C18 batteries are mostly restorations or rebuilds of mid C17 structures, and their construction followed a report on the state of the defences by Colonel Christian Lilley in 1715. Part of an important fortification, centred on Star Castle (qv). Scheduled as an Ancient Monument. (P Laws: The Buildings of Scilly: Redruth: 1980-: 6, 10; B.H. St.J.O'Neil: Isles of Scilly: London (HMSO): 1950-: 26, 31-3; Saunders A: Fortress Britain: Liphook: 1989-: 79-80).

Grade I Listed Building and Scheduled Monument: POWDER MAGAZINE AND ADJOINING BLAST WALLS, BANK LANE:

Powder magazine and blast walls. Early C17. Coursed granite blocks; steeply-pitched scantled slate roof with roll-moulded stone ridge. Rectangular plan. Segmental-arched entry to magazine and blast walls and ventilation ports to magazine. Interior: vaulted stone roof. Built soon after 1601 as part of Francis Godolphin's plans to fortify the Hugh. A rare example of this type, and an important component of the late C16/17 fort centred around Star Castle (qv). Scheduled as an Ancient Monument.

Grade II* Listed building GATEHOUSE COTTAGE, THE GARRISON:

Store, now house. Late C16/ early C17 with later C17 extension to right. Roughly coursed granite with dressed blocks to right; gabled slate roof with carved finials to stone coping; rendered granite ridge stack with drip course. 2-unit plan. One storey with attic; 2-window range. Granite lintels over late C19 central plank door and late horned C19 3/3 and 2/2-pane sashes, that to right with C17 ovolo-moulded lintel and jamb. Late C19 sash set in chamfered surround to right gable end. C20 rear left outshut. Interior: chamfered window architrave adjoins C17 doorway with ovolo-moulded surround to rear left. One C17 principal rafter with curved foot. Shown as a store on 1713 plan of Hugh Fort by Colonel Christian Lilley. An important component of the late C16/C17 fort centred around Star Castle (qv).

Additionally the site lies within the Garrison Archaeological Constraint Area. The Garrison is situated on the Hugh, a major promontory at the southern end of St Mary's which rises to a height of about 40m. The garrison curtain wall follows an extensive and undulating landscape. The application site is situated to the inner west side of the older part of this defensive wall and whilst the historic character is generally well preserved the 2010 Garrison Conservation Plan notes that (page 17) "On the hill above the Powder Magazine...dwellings using 20th century design and materials have been introduced. The

addition of conservatories, large greenhouses and domestic sheds is also noticeable". As noted above this dwelling is situated in an elevated position above and adjacent to the Powder Room.

It is considered that the proposed works to re-roof in natural slate, re-paint the timber cladding in a lighter colour and remove the existing conservatory will all have a positive impact upon the general appearance of this dwelling in relation to the historic character of the garrison landscape. Minor alterations to windows, conversion of the garage and a small area of excavated garden, to accommodate an air source heat pump will have a neutral impact upon the site. The proposal, in terms of the wider character of this historic environment, is considered to be acceptable.

Impact upon residential amenity

As identified above, the application site sits within a large private garden with a vehicular access to the front of the site including an open front garden and larger private rear garden. At its closest point the proposed air source heat unit will be situated 10m from the boundary between the application site and the nearest neighbour, Sanderlings. This neighbour has raised concerns about the impact of this aspect of the development and the potential noise it will generate. It is considered however that the landscape is such that it will be situated within the excavated part of the garden immediately to the south west of the dwelling. ON this basis it is considered that the air source heat pump will not have a significant or harmful impact upon the amenity of this nearest neighbouring property. Other aspects including the replacement roofing materials, repainting timber cladding and minor alterations to the existing fenestration as well as the removal of the conservatory will be acceptable in terms of the wider impact upon privacy and amenity of nearby and adjacent residential properties.

Recommendation:

- Conditionally Approve
- Existing Site Plan DWG001 received 10/08/16
- Proposed Location Plan DWG002 received 10/08/16
- Existing Floor Plans and Elevations DWG003 received 10/08/16
- Existing Floor Plans and Elevations DWG004 received 10/08/16
- Existing Elevations DW005 received 10/08/16
- Existing Elevations DWG006 received 10/08/16
- Proposed Floor Plans and Elevations DWG010 received 10/08/16
- Proposed Floor Plans and Elevations DWG011 received 10/08/16
- Proposed Elevations DWG012 received 10/08/16
- Proposed Elevations DWG013 received 10/08/16

Signed: L WALTON	Dated: 04.10.2016	Signed: C DRYDEN	Dated: 04.10.2016
Planning Officer		Senior Manager	