



# COUNCIL OF THE ISLES OF SCILLY

Planning & Development Department

Town Hall, The Parade, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly, TR21 0LW

01720 424350

planning@scilly.gov.uk

## OFFICER REPORT – DELEGATED

Application number: P/16/126/LBC	Expiry date: 06/02/17
Received on: 09/12/16	Neighbour expiry date: 02/01/17
UPRN: 000192000600	Consultation expiry date: 02/01/17
Legal agreement:	Site notice posted: 12/12/16
Departure:	Site notice expiry: 02/01/17
Complies with Development Plan? Y/N If not, ensure you cover in the report how material considerations outweigh the plan?	
Is this decision contrary to local council recommendation?	

Applicant:	Mrs L Wakefield
Site Address:	Newman House, The Garrison, St Mary's, TR21 0LS
Proposal:	Remedial and repair works both internally and externally, pointing repairs, roof repairs, chimney repairs, flashing and rainwater goods repairs, internal plastering repairs and redecoration.
Application Type:	Listed Building Consent

### Description of site and development:

The proposed works include remedial and repair works both internally and externally. Specifically pointing repairs, roof repairs, chimney repairs, flashing and rainwater goods repairs, internal plastering repairs and redecoration.

The proposed works to the north elevation of Newman House consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s (including opening reveals) and the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s.

The proposed works to the east elevation of Newman House consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s (including opening reveals) and the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s.

The proposed works to the south elevation of Newman House consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s (including opening reveals) and the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s.

The proposed works to the west elevation of Newman House consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s, the removal, using conservation approved methods and materials, existing paint surfacing/s to window arches and keystones, the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s, using an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar, introduce a 'bag-rub' application, using an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar,



introduce a 3-coat render together with the introduction of a mineral paint system to repoint exposed jointing/s and the 'bag-rub' application mortar mixture.

The proposed works to the north elevation of Newman House Annexe consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s (including opening reveals) and the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s.

The proposed works to the east elevation of Newman House Annexe consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s (including opening reveals) and the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s.

The proposed works to the south elevation of Newman House Annexe consists of the removal, using non-power tools, of the existing cementitious pointing application/s (including opening reveals) and the use of an appropriate natural lime/sand mortar to repoint all exposed jointing/s.

The proposed works to Newman House main roof consists of a full inspection to be undertaken on completion of scaffold erection together with the provisional removal and reinstatement of existing ridge tiles (potentially to include dormers), provisional chimney repairs, the provisional rectification/replacement of weather flashing components (all), provisional remedial works to localised areas of slate roofing (including dormers) and the provisional in-situ maintenance to rain water elements.

The proposed works to Newman House windows (internal/external on all elevations including the look-outs) includes their provisional in-situ restoration and decoration.

The proposed works to Newman House Annexe windows (internal/external on all elevations) includes their provisional in-situ restoration and decoration.

The proposed works to the courtyard consist of the removal of the existing failing cast-iron foul waste pipe (FWP) from low-level to eaves only together with the introduction of a cast-iron FWP replacement.

The proposed works to the east elevation of the Studio include the replacement/re-instatement of all missing, broken, failed natural slate to first floor covering/s, the introduction of treated timber fascia board, rainwater gutter and downpipe together with the in-situ restoration to windows (W27, W28 & W29).

The proposed works to the west elevation of the Pottery consist of the removal of existing natural slate (to be re-used for the works to the west elevation of the studio), the introduction of an appropriate render to exposed substrate/s (unknown at present), the introduction of 4 natural slate window cills, the introduction of a mineral paint system to ground and first floor together with the in-situ restoration to windows (W15, W16, W17 & W18).

The proposed works to the internal ground floor of Newman House Dining Room consist of the removal of localised failed/failing surface plaster/s to ceiling and to right hand window reveal together with the introduction of an appropriate natural lime/sand base-coat plaster, the introduction of an appropriate natural lime/sand top-coat plaster and the introduction of an appropriate natural paint.

The proposed works to the internal first floor of Newman House sitting room consist of the removal of localised failed/failing surface plaster/s to ceiling and to right hand window reveal together with the introduction of an appropriate natural lime/sand base-coat plaster, the introduction of an appropriate natural lime/sand top-coat plaster and the introduction of an appropriate natural paint.

The proposed works to the internal first floor of Newman House landing wall consists of the removal of the existing failed wallpaper and replacement.

The proposed works to the internal first floor of Newman House master bedroom consists of the removal of the existing failed wallpaper/s to ceiling and replacement.

The proposed works to the internal second floor of Newman House W.C consists of the removal of the existing failed wallpaper/s and replacement.

The proposed works to the internal second floor of Newman House dormer reveals (all) (D1-D10) consists of the removal of localised existing failed/failing surface plaster/s together with the introduction of an appropriate natural lime/sand base-coat plaster, the introduction of an appropriate natural lime/sand top-coat plaster and the introduction of an appropriate natural paint.

### **Site Description**

Newman House is a detached house originally built as the Garrison Stores c.1716-1718. The dwelling is a Grade II\* Listed Building first added to the Statutory Listed in 1975. The building is described by Historic England as:

Garrison Stores, later house. C.1716-1718; porch and internal alterations by Richardson and Gill, 1927; restored 1971. Roughly coursed granite rubble with dressed granite; stone-coped gabled slate roof; rendered end stacks. Double-depth plan. 2 storeys and attics; symmetrical 5-window range. Segmental arches with dressed voussoirs and keystones over horned 8/8-pane sashes. Porch with cambered roof has similar sash to front and granite lintel over 4-panelled door to left return. Dressed quoins rise from plinth to coved cornice. Hipped dormers with slate-hung cheeks and segmental-arched horned 6/6-pane sashes. Courtyard to rear enclosed by mid C19 extension to south, 1960s rear (east) range and mid C19 north range with brick segmental arch over entry connected to bays in same style as early C18 range with keyed segmental arch over horned 8/8-pane sash above double entry with C20 panelled screen and C20 porch. Interior: chamfered reused beams and early C18 dog-leg with landing staircase with moulded handrail and turned balusters on closed string. Originally built as the garrison storehouse at a cost of £306 15s 10d. An important and mostly complete example of its type, part of an important fortification and one of the most architecturally elaborate buildings on the islands. (P Laws: The Buildings of Scilly: Redruth: 1980-: 10).

Newman House dates back to the 18<sup>th</sup> Century. It is owned by The Duchy of Cornwall.

### **Background and Relevant History**

Planning History for this property starts in 1954 (P0121) when an application was submitted for an extension to the existing house. The council felt that the proposal was permitted development. In 1998 (P4403) a listed building application was submitted for the replacement of the South elevation roof slope with Scantle slate. The application was approved.



### Public representations:

The following neighbours were notified; Isles of Scilly Pottery, Treskey, and Newman Cottage. A site notice has been on display outside the site for a period of 21 days. No letters of representation have been received.

### Consultee representations:

The following statutory consultees were notified; Cornwall Council Archaeological Unit, Historic England and the AONB Partnership. A site notice has been on display outside the site for a period of 21 days.

#### **Cornwall Council Archaeological Unit –**

We would expect a Heritage Assessment to contain more detail on the evolution of the house, as evidenced by the visible architecture and fixtures and fittings, than is provided here. We would also expect heritage professionals to write the assessment rather than the architects or restoration team. However, it sounds like the work is necessary and will be a massive improvement on the existing condition of the building, and has no negative impacts upon it.

#### **AONB Partnership**

The AONB partnership have no specific comments in this instance but highlight that reference should be made to the Council's statutory duty in respect of the AONB designation and reaching decisions on planning applications.

#### **Historic England**

Our specialist staff have considered the information received and we do not wish to offer any comments on this occasion. Historic England recommends that this application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance, and on the basis of our expert conservation advice.

### Constraints and designations:

Listed Building (ID: 1328846 – Grade II\*), Conservation Area, AONB and Heritage Coast

### Relevant policies, SPGs and Government guidance:

#### **Primary Legislation**

#### **The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Area) Act 1990**

The site is within a Conservation Area where there is a requirement to ensure that any development preserves or enhances the character or appearance of the area, as embodied in Section 72 of The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Area) Act 1990. As the proposal relates to a Grade II\* listed building, Section 66(1) of this legislation requires the Local Planning Authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the Listed Building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

## **The Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000**

The Isles of Scilly is also a designated Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB). The legal framework for such areas is provided by The Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000. The Act places a statutory duty on the Local Authority to have regard to the purpose of conserving and enhancing the natural beauty of the AONB when exercising or performing any functions affecting land within it.

### **Planning Policy**

#### **National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2012**

At the heart of the NPPF is presumption in favour of sustainable development. The NPPF does not change the statutory status of the development plan as the starting point for decision making. Proposed development that accords with an up-to-date Local Plan should be approved and proposed development that conflicts should be refused unless other material consideration indicate otherwise. It is highly desirable that local planning authorities should have an up-to-date plan in place. With respect to general development and the Strategic Policies it is considered that the Local Plan remains up to date and conforms to the requirements of the NPPF.

Paragraph 132 of the NPPF states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the assets conservation. As heritage assets are irreplaceable, any harm or loss should require clear or convincing justification. Substantial harm to or loss of grade II listed building should be exceptional. Paragraph 133 states that where a proposed development would lead to substantial harm to or total loss of significance of a designated heritage asset, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the harm is necessary to achieve substantial public benefit that outweighs the harm or loss. Paragraph 134 states that where less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimal viable use.

#### **Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2005**

Policy 1 relates to Environmental Protection and aims to ensure that the quality of the islands environment, including its natural and historic character, is maintained and enhanced. The overall intent of the Local Plan, as reflected in Policy 1, is to protect its environment and keep development to the minimum required for sustaining viable communities.

#### **Appraisal/key issues and conclusion:**

In light of the above mentioned policies and identified designations it is considered that the principal issue for consideration is whether the proposals will preserve the Listed Building and its setting, in accordance with primary legislation. In accordance with planning policy it is essential that this application does not result in either harm to or loss of significance, in accordance with the NPPF. Policy 1 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan requires applications to preserve the architectural or historic interest of all Listed Buildings, including their features and settings.

#### **Impact upon the Listed Building**

“Newman House” has been restored, repaired and maintained by the tenants since the late 1920’s under a lease from The Duchy of Cornwall. Its upkeep and repairs are supported by short term holiday letting.

The building has retained its original footprint and historic form, character and structural integrity. The listing description notes that Newman House is an important and mostly complete example of its type



and it is part of an important fortification and one of the most architecturally elaborate buildings on the islands.

The proposed works consist of repair and restoration works. The Cornwall Archaeological Unit consider that the works sound to be necessary, will be an improvement on the existing condition of the building and will have no negative impacts upon it. The proposed works will help to preserve this heritage asset. The proposed works include recognised conservation techniques. It is considered that the proposed works will cause no loss of historic fabric. It is considered that the proposed works to the West elevation (removal of the cementitious render together with the re-pointing with an appropriate lime/sand mortar to re-point existing jointings) may require further scrutiny. There appears to be no evidence to suggest the elevation was pointed before but this will require the removal of the existing render to ascertain this.

It is considered that the proposed works would not result in the loss of any significance and will preserve the listed building. It is considered overall that the proposed works will not result in either harm or the loss of any historic fabric. It is considered that the significance of this building will not be harmed or lost as a result of this proposal.

#### **Impact upon residential amenity**

The proposed works consist of remedial and repair works. It is considered that the proposed works will improve the visual appearance of the property. It is considered that there will be no impact on existing neighbouring properties.

#### **Recommendation:**

Recommendation: The application be Conditionally Approved subject to the following Conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: In accordance with the requirements of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended).

2. The development hereby permitted, shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details only including:

- Newman House Plans, Drawing Numbers: NH/10516/ELEV-WST/03, NH/10516/ELEV-WST/04, NH/10516/ELEV-NTH/01, NH/10516/ELEV-EST/02, NH/10516/PLAN-GRD/02, NH/10516/PLAN-1<sup>st</sup>/03, NH/10516/PLAN-2<sup>nd</sup>/04, NH/10516/PLAN/ROOF/05, NH/10516/ANNEXE-ELEVS/02 and NH/10516/COURTYARD-ELEVS/01,
- The Heritage Assessment, Ref Newman House, TR21 OLS Dated November 2016

These are signed and stamped as APPROVED

Reason: For the clarity and avoidance of doubt and in the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building in accordance with Policy 1 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2015.

3. Prior to the commencement of the approved development, hereby approved, a scheme including details of the sources of all building materials and the means/location of disposal of all demolition material and all waste arising from building works, including excess material from excavations, shall be submitted to and agreed in writing with the Planning Authority. The development shall thereafter proceed in strict accordance with the approved scheme only.

Reason: This is a pre-commencement condition that requires details that were not submitted as part of the application, but are required to fully understand the impact upon landscape and

management of waste, to be submitted and agreed by the Local Planning Authority. This is to ensure those characteristics which contribute to the status of the Isles of Scilly as a Conservation Area, Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty and Heritage Coast are not eroded by uncontrolled mineral extraction or the tipping of waste. In accordance with the requirements of Policy 1 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2005.

4. In respect of the works to remove the render to the west elevation of Newman House shown on plan numbers NH/10516/ELEV-WST/03 & NH/10516/ELEV-WST/04 the works shall take place in accordance with the agreed specification including the use of non-power tools. This elevation shall be re-rendered unless it is agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority that a re-pointed stone wall, or other alternative finish, is a better solution in relation to the fabric, character and appearance of this Listed Building. If an alternative approach is agreed by the Local Planning Authority to the finish to the west elevation then the works and final appearance shall accord with the revised specification.

Reason: To allow further scrutiny and consideration of the final finish once the existing render has been removed and in the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building in accordance with Policy 1 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2005.

Signed: 	Dated: 23/1/17	Signed:	Dated:
Planning Office		Senior Manager	

