

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/045/LBC

Consultation Response

Date: 09.06.2025

Ref: [P/25/045/LBC](#)

Site: The Town Hall, The Parade, Hugh Town, St Mary's, TR21 0LP.

Proposal: The conservation, upgrading and extension of a Grade II listed 1887 Town Hall to provide a new cultural centre and museum for the Isles of Scilly (Listed Building), previously granted consent ([P/23/048/LBC](#)) on 24th November 2023.

You are being consulted on this application as you may wish to make comments before a decision is made. Should you wish to make any comments on this application, please complete the response form below and return to planning@scilly.gov.uk by the **30th June 2025**.

Link to application: <https://scilly.gov.uk/planning-application/planning-application-p25045lbc>

Link to corresponding application: <https://scilly.gov.uk/planning-application/planning-application-p25041rov> - application to vary Condition 13 (Approved Plans) of planning permission P/23/047/COU for change of use of the Town Hall to provide a new cultural centre and museum and associated works.

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course. If I have not heard back from you by the **30th June 2025** then I will assume you have no comments to make.

Consultee Name:

Vic Robinson – Senior Development Officer (Historic Environment) for Cornwall Council

Thank you for consulting HEP (Conservation) on this listed building application. We have reviewed this revised scheme against the approved listed building consent (P/23/048/LBC) and offer the following advice;

Policy & Guidance Compliance:

The proposal must align with:

Section 16(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning Application

Ref: P/25/045/LBC

Part 16 of the NPPF and the accompanying planning practice guidance

Policy OE7 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2021

We also highlight extracts from the guidance on 'Making Changes to Heritage Assets – Historic England Advice note 2' which states that;

42. The historic fabric will always be an important part of the asset's significance, in normal circumstances the retention of as much historic fabric as possible, together with the appropriate use of materials and methods of repair is likely to conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance, as a fundamental part of any good alteration or conversion. It is not appropriate to sacrifice old work simply to accommodate the new.

43. The junction between new work and the existing fabric needs particular attention, both for its impact on the significance of the existing asset and the impact on the contribution of its setting.

Additional demolition works

The proposed demolition and reconstruction of the full height of internal wall within the Town Hall will result in an additional loss of historic fabric. We note that the previous consent allowed for new openings within this wall at ground and 1st floor level however, further loss of historic fabric will inevitably be harmful to the integrity and significance of the listed building.

As such these additional demolition works require clear and convincing justification. We previously advised that the revised listed building application be supported by the following;

1. A structural assessment with consideration of less harmful options and the reasons why wholesale demolition and rebuild is necessary.
2. Structural drawings and specification.
3. An updated HIA

The applicant has provided an updated HIA which has stated that *'as the contractor commenced work on the back wall of the front part of the Town Hall, it was discovered that the core of the wall was rubble and sand fill but with little or no cement to bond it, and hence that the wall's stability was inadequate to form the openings approved on the planning and listed building consent drawings at ground and first floor levels'*

'The project engineer halted the opening up works and has advised that, given the inadequacy of its core and bonding, the wall structure cannot be relied on to support the lintols over the approved openings, the new lift structure or the first and second floor structures and that attempting to do so would be unsafe'. The HIA further advises that 'Due to the programme constraints and to avoid the significant costs of delays the engineer has been instructed to progress the design for the wall upgrading and replacement for the contractor to order the materials and then commence the works'.

This intimates that the demolition works have already occurred without LBC? We recommend this be clarified and that items 1 and 2 above be submitted for assessment.

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning Application

Ref: P/25/045/LBC

External changes in design of new build elements

The majority of the proposed new external changes do not result in any additional impact on the significance or setting of the listed building.

The exception is the omission of the plant screening. We consider this to be important in order to both screen unsightly services and also to create the appearance of a continuous ridge over this new build range. The omission of this element would be particularly unfortunate in distant views across the town, including views from the Garrison and would be detrimental to the setting of the listed building.

A new stepped feature is to be added over the roof of the listed building (adjacent to the proposed rooflights). No details or information has been submitted regarding what this is or why it is needed. The existing roof is already to accept new rooflights and a significant number of PV panels, plus connecting plant and flat roof sections, which cumulatively impact the character of the roof. Further additions which could be harmful require clear and convincing justification, are there less visible locations for this feature if it is required?

The omission of the roof glazing over the 'boat hall' offers the opportunity to move the more visible proposed PVs on the principal listed building (northern section) to the SW roof slope over the 'boat hall'. This would be a conservation gain.

Roofing

The 2023 consent allowed for the repair and conservation of the existing slate.

This revised application proposes new slates and the slight raising of the slate coverings to allow ventilation and insulation of the roof. Information regarding what the existing slates are and why they cannot be re-used should be provided. If new slate is agreed these should be nail fixed and not clipped.

The pantiles over the single storey outbuilding should be carefully set aside for re-use.

Details

The previous consent imposed certain conditions, some of the details for conditions 2, 3 and 4 have been provided on the revised drawings.

In addition we recommend it is important to agree the following (it might be helpful to the applicant to word these 'prior to installation' or similar, rather than 'before development starts').

1. Details for the new rooflights on the Town Hall roof (these should be flush finish units).
2. Section details for the proposed thermal upgrades to the roof.
3. Details for any strengthening/repairs to the roof structure and details for any masonry repairs, structural repairs or repointing.
4. A schedule of existing and proposed internal finishes within the Town Hall and details for any damp proofing works.

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning Application

Ref: P/25/045/LBC

5. Large scale drawings to a minimum scale of 1:20 for all new windows and doors to the Town Hall, including sections to show profiles, depth of the recess and method of opening and any new cill and lintel details.
6. Details for the new lighting units and any new signage.
7. Details for the new internal insulation for the outbuilding.

Name: Vic Robinson

Date: 20th June 2025