

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/082/HH

Consultation: Conservation Officer Advice Request

Consultee:

Date: 24th September 2025

Ref: P/25/082/HH & P/25/083/LBC

Site: Veronica Lodge, The Garrison, St Mary's, Isles Of Scilly.

Proposal: Full refurbishment of Grade II listed dwelling including demolition of 2 No. porches with 1 No. replacement porch, re-roof using existing timbers, external overhaul and internal reconfiguration works including electrical rewire and replumb (Listed Building).

You are being consulted on this application as archaeological input is required to inform the decision. Please complete the response form below and return to planning@scilly.gov.uk as soon as possible and no later than **15th October 2025** or by post to the Planning Department, Old Wesleyan Chapel, Garrison Lane, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly TR21 0JD.

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course.

<https://scilly.gov.uk/planning-application/planning-application-p25082hh>

Comments;

The Site

Veronica Lodge is a Grade II listed building, located within the immediate setting of Grade II listed Hugh House (immediately to the south), and is within The Garrison near Star Castle, which are Grade I Listed and Scheduled Monuments.

The Garrison is a fortified headland of exceptional historic importance, representing over 400 years of military evolution, its strategic value was recognized after the threat posed by the Spanish Armada in 1588. This led to the construction of Star Castle in 1593–94, initiating a shift in Scilly's defensive priorities. Over time, the site expanded to include batteries, barracks, and a curtain wall, adapting to changing military needs. During the Civil War, it served as a Royalist stronghold and underwent further fortification in the 18th century amid renewed Spanish threats. The Garrison remained active through the 19th and 20th centuries, with installations added during both World Wars. Today, the site stands as a layered historical landscape, offering insight into evolving military architecture and strategic defence from the post-medieval period to modern times.

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning Application

Ref: P/25/082/HH

Veronica Lodge holds notable historic and architectural significance as a late 18th-century officer's residence within the fortified landscape of The Garrison on St Mary's, Isles of Scilly. Constructed in the 1790s to house the Commanding Officer of the Garrison, the building reflects the strategic military importance of the site during a period of heightened coastal defence. By 1834 it was recorded as being occupied by the Royal Naval Coastguard. Architecturally, it exemplifies Georgian domestic design adapted to a military context, with its symmetrical double-depth plan, hipped scantle slate roof, and refined detailing such as sash windows and a semi-circular arched doorway with decorative fanlight and panel door. The building sustained a phase of modernisation in the 1970s but retains a high degree of architectural integrity.

It sits within a highly sensitive heritage context, as part of a nationally significant defensive complex. Veronica Lodge represents both the functional and residential aspects of Scilly's military heritage and its values and significance are entwined with those of the Garrison.

The building is understood to be currently unoccupied and is in need of comprehensive repair and refurbishment.

Duty, Policy and Guidance

The proposals must comply with the following;

Section 16(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 – special regard must be paid to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Section 72(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 - Development must preserve or enhance the character or appearance of Conservation Areas.

Part 16 of the NPPF and the accompanying planning practice guidance –

Heritage assets are an irreplaceable resource and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of existing and future generations (paragraph 202).

Great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance (paragraph 212).

Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification (paragraph 213)

Policy OE7 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan, adopted in 2021, reinforces that any harm to the significance of a designated or non-designated heritage asset must be justified and that proposals causing harm will be weighed against the substantial public, not private, benefits of the proposal. Also, that it should be demonstrated that all reasonable efforts have been made to mitigate the extent of the harm to the significance of the asset.

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/082/HH

Advice

Consent is sought for the following works;

- Re-roofing using sized Trevillet slates with PV slates to the rear, and the insertion of a Velux rooflight
- Refurbishment of the house and internal re-modelling including the removal of a ground floor internal wall
- Reinstatement of the cross-passage plan form
- Removal of inappropriate wall linings and installation of new insulating lime plaster
- Replacement of the front porch and demolition of the rear porch
- Some replacement windows and doors
- Installation of new wood burner and hearth

The scheme is a re-submission of the works approved under P/21/055/HH and P/21/056/LBC with the addition of the following;

- The removal of the existing external cement render to expose the dressed granite
- Landscaping works, new hedge and steps to form a new access and additional garden space for North Flat, Hugh House

We note that the replacement of the existing scantle slate roof with sized slate has previously been consented and was balanced against the benefits of building back into use and in a proper state of repair but we draw the applicants attention to the following guidance;

SPAB technical guidance - Slating in South-West England

<https://www.spab.org.uk/sites/default/files/SPAB%20Technical%20advice%20note-Slating%20in%20South%20West%20England.pdf>

Scantle slate roofs are a distinctive and historically significant roofing tradition found primarily in West Cornwall and Scilly. They contribute to the unique character of historic landscapes in the region. These roofs are constructed using small, randomly sized slates, typically between 6 to 12 inches long, laid in

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning Application

Ref: P/25/082/HH

a triple-lap system known as three-and-a-half-pin slating. This technique provides enhanced resistance to wind and rain, making it particularly suitable for exposed coastal environments. Scantle slating is either dry-laid or wet-laid with mortar bedding, depending on local exposure, and can include lime torching on the underside for additional weatherproofing. The slates are traditionally peg-hung over riven laths. The visual effect is one of fine texture and layered depth, contributing to the vernacular charm of historic buildings.

Architecturally, scantle roofs reflect local craftsmanship, resourceful use of materials, and regional identity, with their survival offering valuable insight into traditional building practices. Their continued use and conservation are vital to maintaining the distinctive roofscape of the Isles of Scilly.

A change from scantle to sized slate will change the character of the roof and we recommend this be reconsidered with a view to re-laying a traditional scantle slate roof. Trevillet Quarry can supply 11' to 7' 'peggies'.

With regards to the render removal proposal, this will benefit the building in terms of breathability and reinstate it's original dressed granite appearance. It is important that trials of render removal be undertaken to ensure the render can be safely removed without damaging the substrate.

The proposed landscaping works, new hedging and steps to form a new access and additional garden space for North Flat, Hugh House are not considered to have any harmful impact on the setting of the adjacent listed buildings or significance of the site.

Suggested conditions:

- Agreement of a roof slating specification (to include the slate type, sizing, method of coursing, hip detail, ridge detail, type of fixing, details for any membrane and details for any thermal upgrades in the roof space)
- Details for the rooflight (this should be slim framed and flush finish)
- A method statement for the cement render removal and making good the dressed granite
- Joinery details for the proposed new external doors
- Joinery details for the proposed replacement porch (it is recommended the details be informed by the historic photograph of the original porch)
- Details for the internal insulating lime render
- Details for the new woodburner and flue

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/082/HH

Completed By	Time Spent	Date
Vic Robinson – Cornwall Council Senior Development Officer (Historic Environment)	4.5 hrs	15th October 2025
P/25/082/HH & P/25/083/LBC		