Ref: P/25/089/FUL & P/25/090/LBC

Consultation: Conservation Officer Advice Request

Date: 21st October 2025

Ref: P/25/089/FUL & P/25/090/LBC

Site: Gray's, The Bank, Hugh Town, St Mary's.

Proposal: Installation of Juliet Balconies, windows, doors and balustrades, and internal alterations

to the existing flats (Listed Building).

You are being consulted on this application as archaeological input is required to inform the decision. Please complete the response form below and return to planning@scilly.gov.uk as soon as possible and no later than 11th November 2025 or by post to the Planning Department, Old Wesleyan Chapel, Garrison Lane, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly TR21 0JD.

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course.

Comments:

The site

The property is Grade II listed (as part of a terrace of 4 houses) and in the Isles of Scilly Conservation Area. It was listed in 1975 and described at the time as;

Terrace of four houses, now houses, flats and shop. Late C18. Coursed and squared granite; parapeted roofs not visible; brick stacks. Double-depth plan, each with central entrance hall. 2 storeys; each of 3-window first-floor range. Granite lintels over late C19 horned 2/2-pane sashes, except 6/6-pane sashes to first floor of Michael Gray and early C20 (probably 1920s Duchy of Cornwall) tripartite sashes with glazing bars flanking first-floor central 6/6-pane sash to Bank House. Pentland Flats to left has trellis porch to front of doorcase with plain wooden architrave and scroll brackets to flat hood; panelled reveals framing 1930s door; later C19 canted bay windows with plate-glass sashes (of 2/2-panes to front) to ground-floor bay on left and of 2 storeys to right. Scillonia has 6-panelled door set in raised moulded architrave. Bank House has C20 glazed door set in doorcase with plain wooden architrave and scroll brackets to flat hood. Michael Gray has similar 2-storey bay with rendered walls to left and late C19 shop front with colonettes and arched spandrels framing plate-glass windows and decorative iron cresting to cornice above canopy box and plain fascia. Rear elevation has sashes with glazing bars to Bank House and mid C20 flat-roofed extensions. Interiors not inspected but noted as having panelled shutters, doors and original staircases.

The building is part of a late 18th-century terrace, now adapted for mixed residential and commercial use. It is significant for its architectural detailing and survival of historic features. Its coursed granite

Ref: P/25/089/FUL & P/25/090/LBC

construction, sash windows, and decorative shopfront illustrate evolving styles from the Georgian period through the 19th and early 20th centuries. The terrace contributes strongly to the historic character of its setting and reflects the social and economic development of the area over more than two centuries.

To the rear there is a two storey 1970's flat roof addition which has been added over a historic basement area. The basement area retains historic fabric (granite walling, historic openings and granite steps) and this contributes to the historic significance of the listed building. The 1970's fabric above does not contribute to the significance of the listed building.

Duty, Policy and Guidance

The proposals must comply with the following;

Section 16(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 – special regard must be paid to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Section 72(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 - Development must preserve or enhance the character or appearance of Conservation Areas.

Part 16 of the NPPF and the accompanying planning practice guidance –

Heritage assets are an irreplaceable resource and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of existing and future generations (paragraph 202).

Great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance (paragraph 212).

Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification (paragraph 213)

Policy OE7 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan, adopted in 2021, reinforces that any harm to the significance of a designated or non-designated heritage asset must be justified and that proposals causing harm will be weighed against the substantial public, not private, benefits of the proposal. Also, that it should be demonstrated that all reasonable efforts have been made to mitigate the extent of the harm to the significance of the asset.

We also highlight the guidance on 'Making Changes to Heritage Assets – Historic England Advice note 2' which states that;

42. The historic fabric will always be an important part of the asset's significance, in normal circumstances the retention of as much historic fabric as possible, together with the appropriate use of

Ref: P/25/089/FUL & P/25/090/LBC

materials and methods of repair is likely to conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance, as a fundamental part of any good alteration or conversion. It is not appropriate to sacrifice old work simply to accommodate the new.

Advice

The proposal seeks rear elevational changes including the enlargement of windows and new Juliet balconies openings in place of existing windows. We also note the proposed drawings show the creation of a new basement flat.

The replacement of white upvc windows with white upvc doors and balcony guarding, and enlarged upvc window within the rear upper floors (1970's construction) is considered to have a neutral impact on the significance of the listed building, and on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

However, the proposed changes at basement level will result in harmful impacts to the historic integrity of the listed building by reason of;

- The creation of a new window opening in the original rear wall of the building.
- Removal of an existing window in the original rear wall to create access to the proposed new stairs.
- Removal of a door and blocking up of an existing opening in the original rear wall.
- The loss of a pair of timber doors at basement level and insertion of upvc units at this level.

The applicants Heritage Statement does not assess the impact of these changes or provide information regarding the historic significance of those features affected. Neither does it rehearse if there are any historic features surviving in the existing unconverted basement such as historic surfacing etc.

In the interests of the preservation of the building it is important that historic fabric and features of historic interest are not removed in order to create the basement flat. Additionally, new fenestration at this level should be of timber construction reflective of the surviving historic fenestration found in the front and rear 18th century elevations.

Completed By	Time Spent	Date
Vic Robinson – Cornwall Council Senior Development Officer (Historic Environment)	2 hours	7 th Nov 2025
P/25/089/FUL & P/25/090/LBC		

Ref: P/25/089/FUL & P/25/090/LBC